# Computing L-functions of hyperelliptic curves 

Andrew V. Sutherland

Massachusetts Institute of Technology
ICTP Workshop on the Arithmetic of Hyperelliptic Curves September 8, 2017

Joint with (various subsets of) A. Booker, D. Platt, D. Harvey, M. Massierer.

## Zeta functions and $L$-functions

Let $X / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nice (smooth, projective, geometrically integral) curve of genus $g$. For primes $p$ of good reduction (for $X$ ) we have a zeta function

$$
Z\left(X_{p} ; s\right):=\exp \left(\sum_{r \geq 1} \# X_{p}\left(\mathbb{F}_{p^{r}}\right) \frac{T^{r}}{r}\right)=\frac{L_{p}(T)}{(1-T)(1-p T)},
$$

in which the $L$-polynomial $L_{p} \in \mathbb{Z}[T]$ in the numerator satisfies

$$
L_{p}(T)=T^{2 g} \chi_{p}(1 / T)=1-a_{p} T+\cdots+p^{g} T^{2 g} ;
$$

here $\chi_{p}(T)$ is the charpoly of the Frobenius endomorphism of $\operatorname{Jac}\left(X_{p}\right)$ (this implies $\# \operatorname{Jac}\left(X_{p}\right)=L_{p}(1)$, for example). The $L$-function of $X$ is

$$
L(X, s)=L(\operatorname{Jac}(X), s):=\sum_{n \geq 1} a_{n} n^{-s}:=\prod_{p} L_{p}\left(p^{-s}\right)^{-1},
$$

where the Dirichlet coefficients $a_{n} \in \mathbb{Z}$ are determined by the $L_{p}(T)$. In particular, $a_{p}=p+1-\# X_{p}\left(\mathbb{F}_{p}\right)$ is the trace of Frobenius.

## The Selberg class with polynomial Euler factors

The Selberg class $S^{\text {poly }}$ consists of Dirichlet series $L(s)=\sum_{n \geq 1} a_{n} n^{-s}$ :
(1) $L(s)$ has an analytic continuation that is holomorphic at $s \neq 1$;
(2) For some $\gamma(s)=Q^{s} \prod_{i=1}^{r} \Gamma\left(\lambda_{i} s+\mu_{i}\right)$ and $\varepsilon$, the completed $L$-function $\Lambda(s):=\gamma(s) L(s)$ satisfies the functional equation

$$
\Lambda(s)=\varepsilon \overline{\Lambda(1-\bar{s})},
$$

where $Q>0, \lambda_{i}>0, \operatorname{Re}\left(\mu_{i}\right) \geq 0,|\varepsilon|=1$. Define $\operatorname{deg} L:=2 \sum_{i}^{r} \lambda_{i}$.
(3) $a_{1}=1$ and $a_{n}=O\left(n^{\epsilon}\right)$ for all $\epsilon>0$ (Ramanujan conjecture).
(4) $L(s)$ has an Euler product $L(s)=\prod_{p} L_{p}\left(p^{-s}\right)^{-1}$ in which each local factor $L_{p} \in \mathbb{Z}[T]$ has degree at most $\operatorname{deg} L$.

The Dirichlet series $L_{\mathrm{an}}(s, X):=L\left(X, s+\frac{1}{2}\right)$ satisfies (3) and (4), and conjecturally lies in $S^{\text {poly }}$; for $g=1$ this is known (via modularity).

## Strong multiplicity one

## Theorem (Kaczorowski-Perelli 2001)

If $A(s)=\sum_{n \geq 1} a_{n} n^{-s}$ and $B(s)=\sum_{n \geq 1} b_{n} n^{-s}$ lie in $S^{\text {poly }}$ and $a_{p}=b_{p}$ for all but finitely many primes $p$, then $A(s)=B(s)$.

## Corollary

If $L_{\mathrm{an}}(s, X)$ lies in $S^{\text {poly }}$ then it is determined by (any choice of) all but finitely many coefficients $a_{p}$. In particular, all of the local factors are completely determined by the Frobenius traces $a_{p}$ at good primes.

Henceforth we assume that $L_{\mathrm{an}}(s, X) \in S^{\text {poly }}$.
Let $\Gamma_{\mathbb{C}}(s):=2(2 \pi)^{s} \Gamma(s)$, and define $\Lambda(X, s):=\Gamma_{\mathbb{C}}(s)^{g} L(X, s)$. Then

$$
\Lambda(X, s)=\varepsilon N^{1-s} \Lambda(X, 2-s)
$$

where the analytic root number $\varepsilon= \pm 1$ and analytic conductor $N \in \mathbb{Z}_{\geq 1}$ are also determined by the Frobenius traces $a_{p}$ at good primes.

## Effective strong multiplicity one

Fix a finite set of primes $\mathcal{S}$ (e.g. bad primes) and an integer $M$ that we know is a multiple of the conductor $N$ (e.g. $M=\Delta(X)$ ).

There is a finite set of possibilities for $\varepsilon= \pm 1, N \mid M$, and the Euler factors $L_{p} \in \mathbb{Z}[T]$ for $p \in \mathcal{S}$ (the coefficients of $L_{p}(T)$ are bounded).

Suppose we know the $a_{n}$ for all $n \leq c_{1} \sqrt{M}$ with $p \nmid n$ for $p \in \mathcal{S}$. For a suitably large $c_{1}$, exactly one choice of $\varepsilon, N$, and $L_{p}(T)$ for $p \in \mathcal{S}$ will make it possible for $L(X, s)$ to satisfy its functional equation. ${ }^{1}$

One can explicitly determine a set of $O\left(N^{\epsilon}\right)$ candidate values of $c_{1}$, one of which is guaranteed to work; in practice the first one usually works.

This gives an effective algorithm to compute $\varepsilon, N$, and $L_{p}(T)$ for $p \in \mathcal{S}$, provided we can compute $L_{p}(T)$ at good $p \leq B$, where $B=O(\sqrt{N})$.

[^0]
## Algorithms to compute zeta functions

Given $X / \mathbb{Q}$ of genus $g$, we want to compute $L_{p}(T)$ for all $\operatorname{good} p \leq B$.

## complexity per prime

## (ignoring $(\log \log p)^{O(1)}$ factors

algorithm
point enumeration
group computation $p$-adic cohomology
CRT (Schoof-Pila) average poly-time
$g=1 \quad g=2 \quad g=3$

| $p \log p$ | $p^{2} \log p$ | $p^{3}(\log p)^{2}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $p^{1 / 4} \log p$ | $p^{3 / 4} \log p$ | $p(\log p)^{2}$ |
| $p^{1 / 2}(\log p)^{2}$ | $p^{1 / 2}(\log p)^{2}$ | $p^{1 / 2}(\log p)^{2}$ |
| $(\log p)^{5}$ | $(\log p)^{8}$ | $(\log p)^{12 ?}$ |
| $(\log p)^{4}$ | $(\log p)^{4}$ | $(\log p)^{4}$ |

For $L(X, s)=\sum a_{n} n^{-s}$, we only need $a_{p^{2}}$ for $p^{2} \leq B$, and $a_{p^{3}}$ for $p^{3} \leq B$. For $1<r \leq g$ we can easily compute $a_{p^{r}}$ for $p^{r} \leq B$ in time $O(B \log B)$.

Bottom line: it all comes down to computing Frobenius traces.

## Warmup: average polynomial-time in genus 1

Let $X: y^{2}=f(x)$ with $\operatorname{deg} f=3,4$ and $f(0) \neq 0$, and let $f_{k}^{n}$ denote the coefficient of $x^{k}$ in $f^{n}$. For each good prime $p$ we have

$$
\begin{aligned}
\# X_{p}\left(\mathbb{F}_{p}\right) & =\sum_{a, b \in \mathbb{F}_{p}}\left[b^{2}=f(a)\right]+N_{\infty} \\
& \equiv \sum_{a, b \in \mathbb{F}_{p}}\left(1-\left(b^{2}-f(a)\right)^{p-1}\right)+N_{\infty} \\
& \equiv-\sum_{a, b \in \mathbb{F}_{p}} \sum_{r}\binom{p-1}{r} b^{2 r}(-f(a))^{p-1-r}+N_{\infty} \\
& \equiv\binom{p-1}{\frac{p-1}{2}}(-1)^{\frac{p-1}{2}} \sum_{a \in \mathbb{F}_{p}} f(a)^{\frac{p-1}{2}}+N_{\infty} \\
& \equiv\left(-f_{2 p-2}^{(p-1) / 2}-f_{p-1}^{(p-1) / 2}\right)+\left(1+\left(f_{4}\right)^{(p-1) / 2)}\right) \\
& \equiv 1-f_{p-1}^{(p-1) / 2} \equiv 1-a_{p}
\end{aligned}
$$

Thus $a_{p} \equiv f_{p-1}^{(p-1) / 2}$. This determines $a_{p} \in \mathbb{Z}$ for $p \geq 17$, since $\left|a_{p}\right| \leq 2 \sqrt{p}$.

## Warmup: average polynomial-time in genus 1

We want to compute $f_{p-1}^{(p-1) / 2}$ modulo $p$ for many primes $p$.
The relations $f^{n+1}=f \cdot f^{n}$ and $\left(f^{n+1}\right)^{\prime}=(n+1) f^{\prime} \cdot f^{n}$ yield the identity

$$
k f_{0} f_{k}^{n}=\sum_{1 \leq i \leq d}(i(n+1)-k) f_{i} f_{k-i}^{n},
$$

valid for all $k, n \geq 0$. For $d=3$ (and similarly for $d=4$ ), we define

$$
v_{k}^{n}:=\left[f_{k-2}^{n}, f_{k-1}^{n}, f_{k}^{n}\right], \quad M_{k}^{n}:=\left[\begin{array}{ccc}
0 & 0 & (3 n+3-k) f_{3} \\
k f_{0} & 0 & (2 n+2-k) f_{2} \\
0 & k f_{0} & (n+1-k) f_{1}
\end{array}\right] .
$$

For all positive integers $k$ and $n$ we then have

$$
v_{k}^{n}=\frac{1}{k f_{0}} v_{k-1}^{n} M_{k}^{n}=\frac{1}{\left(f_{0}\right)^{k} k!} v_{0}^{n} M_{1}^{n} \cdots M_{k}^{n} .
$$

## Warmup: average polynomial-time in genus 1

We want to compute $a_{p} \equiv f_{2 n}^{n} \bmod p$ with $n:=(p-1) / 2$.
This is the last entry of the vector

$$
v_{2 n}^{n}=\frac{1}{f_{0}^{2 n}(2 n!)} v_{0}^{n} M_{1}^{n} \cdots M_{2 n}^{n}=-v_{0}^{n} M_{1}^{n} \cdots M_{2 n}^{n}
$$

reduced modulo $p=2 n+1$.
Observe that $2(n+1) \equiv 1 \bmod p$, so $2 M_{k}^{n} \equiv M_{k} \bmod p$, where

$$
M_{k}:=\left[\begin{array}{ccc}
0 & 0 & (3-2 k) f_{3} \\
k f_{0} & 0 & (2-2 k) f_{2} \\
0 & k f_{0} & (1-2 k) f_{1}
\end{array}\right] \in \mathbb{Z}^{3 \times 3}
$$

is independent of $\boldsymbol{p}$. For each odd prime $p=2 n+1$ we have

$$
v_{2 n}^{n} \equiv-\left(\frac{f_{0}}{p}\right) V_{0} M_{1} \cdots M_{2 n-1} \bmod p \quad\left(\text { where } V_{0}=[0,0,1]\right)
$$

## Accumulating remainder tree

Given matrices $M_{0}, \ldots, M_{n-1}$ and moduli $m_{1}, \ldots, m_{n}$, to compute

$$
\begin{array}{r}
M_{0} \bmod m_{1} \\
M_{0} M_{1} \bmod m_{2} \\
M_{0} M_{1} M_{2} \bmod m_{3} \\
M_{0} M_{1} M_{2} M_{3} \bmod m_{4} \\
\cdots \\
M_{0} M_{1} \cdots M_{n-2} M_{n-1} \bmod m_{n}
\end{array}
$$

multiply adjacent pairs and recursively compute

$$
\begin{array}{r}
\left(M_{0} M_{1}\right) \bmod m_{2} m_{3} \\
\left(M_{0} M_{1}\right)\left(M_{2} M_{3}\right) \bmod m_{4} m_{5}
\end{array}
$$

$$
\left(M_{0} M_{1}\right) \cdots\left(M_{n-2} M_{n-1}\right) \bmod m_{n}
$$

and adjust the results as required (for better results, use a forest).

## Complexity analysis

Assume $\log \left|f_{i}\right|=O(\log B)$. The recursion has depth $O(\log B)$, and in each recursive step we multiply and reduce a bunch of $3 \times 3$ matrices with integer entries whose total bitsize is $O(B \log B)$.

We can do all the multiplications/reductions at any given level of the recursion using $O(\mathrm{M}(B \log B))=B(\log B)^{2+o(1)}$ bit operations.

Total complexity is $B(\log B)^{3+o(1)}$, or $(\log p)^{4+o(1)}$ per prime $p \leq B$.
For a single prime $p$ we do not have a polynomial-time algorithm, but we can give an $O\left(p^{1 / 2}(\log p)^{1+o(1)}\right)$ algorithm using the same matrices.

This is a silly way to compute a single $a_{p}$ in genus 1 , but its generalization to genus 2 is competitive, and in genus 3 it yields the fastest practical method known (within the feasible range of $p$ ).

## Efficiently handling a single prime

Simply computing $V_{0} M_{1} \cdots M_{p-1}$ modulo $p$ is surprisingly quick (faster than semi-naïve point-counting); it takes $p(\log p)^{1+o(1)}$ time. For small $p$ (into the thousands), this is the the fastest approach. But we can do better.

Viewing $M_{k} \bmod p$ as $M \in \mathbb{F}_{p}[k]^{3 \times 3}$, we compute

$$
A(k):=M(k) M(k+1) \cdots M(k+r-1) \in \mathbb{F}_{p}[k]^{3 \times 3}
$$

with $r \approx \sqrt{p}$, pick $s \approx \sqrt{p}$ so $r s<p$ and evaluate $A(k)$ at $s=\lfloor p / r\rfloor$ points to get
$M_{1} M_{2} \cdots M_{p-1} \equiv_{p} A(1) A(r+1) A(2 r+1) \cdots A((s-1) r+1) M_{s r+1} \cdots M_{p-1}$.
Using standard product tree and multipoint evaluation techniques this takes $O\left(\mathrm{M}\left(p^{1 / 2}\right) \log p\right)=p^{1 / 2}(\log p)^{2+o(1)}$ time.

Bostan-Gaudry-Schost: $p^{1 / 2}(\log p)^{1+o(1)}$ time.

## The Hasse-Witt matrix of a hyperelliptic curve

Let $X_{p} / \mathbb{F}_{p}$ be a hyperelliptic curve $y^{2}=f(x)$ of genus $g$ (with $p \neq 2$ ). As in the warmup, let $f_{k}^{n}$ denote the coefficient of $x^{k}$ in $f^{n}$.

The Hasse-Witt matrix of $X_{p}$ is $W_{p}:=\left[f_{p i-j}^{n}\right]_{i j} \in \mathbb{F}_{p}^{g \times g}$ with $n=(p-1) / 2$. By the same argument used in our warmup, have

$$
a_{p} \equiv \sum_{i=1}^{g} f_{i p-i}^{n}=\operatorname{tr} W_{p}
$$

and for $p>16 g^{2}$ this uniquely determines $a_{p} \in \mathbb{Z}$.
In fact, as proved by Manin, we have

$$
L_{p}(T) \equiv \operatorname{det}\left(I-T W_{p}\right) \bmod p
$$

One can define the Hasse-Witt matrix for curve over $\mathbb{F}_{p}$ : it is the matrix of the $p$-power Frobenius acting on $H^{1}\left(X_{p}, \mathcal{O}_{X_{p}}\right)$, and via Serre duality, the matrix of the Cartier-Manin operator acting on $\Omega_{X_{p}}$.

## Hyperelliptic average polynomial-time

As in our warmup, assume $f(0) \neq 0$ and define $v_{k}^{n}:=\left[f_{k-d+1}^{n}, \ldots, f_{k}^{n}\right]$. The last $g$ entries of $v_{2 n}^{n}$ form the first row of $W_{p}$, and we have

$$
v_{2 n}^{n}=-\left(\frac{f_{0}}{p}\right) V_{0} M_{1} \cdots M_{p-1} \bmod p \quad\left(\text { where } V_{0}=[0, \ldots, 0,1]\right)
$$

Compute the first row of $W_{p}$ for good $p \leq B$ in $O\left(g^{2} B(\log B)^{3+o(1)}\right)$ time.
To get the remaining rows, consider the isomorphic curve $y^{2}=f(x+a)$ whose Hasse-Witt matrix $W_{p}(a)=T(a) W_{p} T(-a)$ is conjugate to $W_{p}$ via

$$
T(a):=\left[\binom{j-1}{i-1} a^{j-1}\right]_{i j} \in \mathbb{F}_{p}^{g \times g}
$$

Given the first row of $W_{p}(a)$ for $g$ distinct values of $a$ we can compute all the rows of $W_{p}$. Total complexity is $O\left(g^{3} B(\log B)^{3+o(1)}\right)$, with an average complexity of $O\left(g^{3} p^{4+o(1)}\right)$, which is polynomial in both $g$ and $\log p$.

## Analytic rank data for elliptic/hyperelliptic curves

Genus 1 curves with $\left|\Delta_{\min }\right| \leq 10^{5}: 17,247 \quad$ (exact count)
Genus 2 curves with $\left|\Delta_{\min }\right| \leq 10^{6}: 66,158 \quad$ (lower bound)
Genus 3 curves with $\left|\Delta_{\min }\right| \leq 10^{7}: 67,879 \quad$ (lower bound)
genus 1

| rank | count | percent | count | percent | count | percent |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0 | 6408 | 37,15 | 12131 | 18.34 | 7770 | 11.45 |
| 1 | 8586 | 49.78 | 30579 | 46.22 | 30840 | 45.47 |
| 2 | 2182 | 12.65 | 20561 | 31.08 | 25486 | 30.11 |
| 3 | 71 | 0.41 | 2877 | 4.35 | 3723 | 5.49 |
| 4 | 0 | 0.00 | 10 | 0.02 | 8 | 0.01 |

Genus 2 data includes all $y^{2}+h(x) y=f(x)$ with $\|h\|_{\infty} \leq 1,\|f\|_{\infty} \leq 90$. Genus 3 data includes all $y^{2}+h(x) y=f(x)$ with $\|h\|_{\infty} \leq 1,\|f\|_{\infty} \leq 31$.

## Genus 3 curves

The canonical embedding of a genus 3 curve into $\mathbb{P}^{2}$ is either
(1) a degree-2 cover of a smooth conic (hyperelliptic case);
(2) a smooth plane quartic (generic case).

Average polynomial-time implementations now available for all cases:

- rational hyperelliptic model $y^{2}=f(x)$ [Harvey-S 2014].
- degree-2 cover of a smooth conic [Harvey-Massierer-S 2016].
- smooth plane quartic [Harvey-S 2017].

Essentially all prior work in genus 3 uses $p$-adic cohomology:
[Kedlaya 2001], [Gaudry-Gürel 2003], [Lauder 2004], [Kedlaya 2006], [Castryck-Denef-Vercauteren 2006], [Abbott-Kedlaya-Roe 2006], [Harvey 2007], [Hubrechts 2007], [Harvey 2010], [Hubrechts 2011], [Harrison 2012], [Tuitman-Pancrantz 2013], [Tuitman 2015], [Costa 2015], [Tuitman-Castryck 2016], [Shieh 2016]

## The Hasse-Witt matrix of a smooth plane quartic

Let $X_{p} / \mathbb{F}_{p}$ be a smooth plane quartic defined by $f(x, y, z)=0$. For $n \geq 0$ let $f_{i, j, k}^{n}$ denote the coefficient of $x^{i} y^{j} z^{k}$ in $f^{n}$.

The Hasse-Witt matrix of $X_{p}$ is the $3 \times 3$ matrix

$$
W_{p}:=\left[\begin{array}{lll}
f_{p-1, p-1,2 p-2}^{p-1} & f_{2 p}^{p-1}-1, p-1, p-2 & f_{p-1,2 p-1, p-2}^{p-1} \\
f_{p-1}^{p-1, p-1,2 p-1} & f_{2 p}^{p-1, p-1, p-1} & f_{p-2,2 p-1, p-1}^{p-1} \\
f_{p-1, p-2,2 p-1}^{p-1} & f_{2 p-1, p-2, p-1}^{p-1} & f_{p-1,2 p-2, p-1}^{p-1}
\end{array}\right] .
$$

This case of smooth plane curves of degree $d>4$ is similar.
More generally, given a singular plane model for any nice curve (equivalently, a defining polynomial for its function field) one can use the methods of Stohr-Voloch to explicitly determine $W_{p}$.

Target coefficients of $f^{p-1}$ for $p=7$ :


## Coefficient relations

Let $\partial_{x}=x \frac{\partial}{\partial x}$ (degree-preserving). The relations

$$
f^{p-1}=f \cdot f^{p-2} \quad \text { and } \quad \partial_{x} f^{p-1}=-\left(\partial_{x} f\right) f^{p-2}
$$

yield the relation

$$
\sum_{i^{\prime}+j^{\prime}+k^{\prime}=4}\left(i+i^{\prime}\right) f_{i^{\prime}, j^{\prime}, k^{\prime}} f_{i-i^{\prime}, j-j^{\prime}, k-k^{\prime}}^{p-2}=0
$$

among nearby coefficients of $f^{p-2}$ (a triangle of side length 5).
Replacing $\partial_{x}$ by $\partial_{y}$ yields a similar relation (replace $i+i^{\prime}$ with $j+j^{\prime}$ ).

## Coefficient triangle

For $p=7$ with $i=12, j=5, k=7$ the related coefficients of $f^{p-2}$ are:


## Moving the triangle

Now consider a bigger triangle with side length 7 . Our relations allow us to move the triangle around:


An initial "triangle" at the edge can be efficiently computed using coefficients of $f(x, 0, z)^{p-2}$.

## Computing one Hasse-Witt matrix

Nondegeneracy: we need $f(1,0,0), f(0,1,0), f(0,0,1)$ nonzero and $f(0, y, z), f(x, 0, z), f(x, y, 0)$ squarefree (easily achieved for large $p$ ).

The basic strategy to compute $W_{p}$ is as follows:

- There is a $28 \times 28$ matrix $M_{j}$ that shifts our 7-triangle from $y$-coordinate $j$ to $j+1$; its coefficients depend on $j$ and $f$. In fact a $16 \times 16$ matrix $M_{i}$ suffices (use smoothness of $C$ ).
- Applying the product $M_{0} \cdots M_{p-2}$ to an initial triangle on the edge and applying a final adjustment to shift from $f^{p-2}$ to $f^{p-1}$ gets us one column of the Hasse-Witt matrix $W_{p}$.
- By applying the same product (or its inverse) to different initial triangles we can compute all three columns of $W_{p}$.

We have thus reduced the problem to computing $M_{1} \cdots M_{p-2} \bmod p$, which we already know how to do, either in $p^{1 / 2}(\log p)^{1+o(1)}$ time, or in average polynomial time $(\log p)^{4+o(1)}$.

## Cumulative timings for genus 3 curves

Time to compute $L_{p}(T) \bmod p$ for all $\operatorname{good} p \leq B$.

| $B$ | spq-Costa-AKR | spq-HS | ghyp-MHS | hyp-HS | hyp-Harvey |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $2^{12}$ | 18 | 1.4 | 0.3 | 0.1 | 1.3 |
| $2^{13}$ | 49 | 2.4 | 0.7 | 0.2 | 2.6 |
| $2^{14}$ | 142 | 4.6 | 1.7 | 0.5 | 5.4 |
| $2^{15}$ | 475 | 9.4 | 4.6 | 1.0 | 12 |
| $2^{16}$ | 1,670 | 21 | 11 | 2.1 | 29 |
| $2^{17}$ | 5,880 | 47 | 27 | 5.3 | 74 |
| $2^{18}$ | 22,300 | 112 | 62 | 14 | 192 |
| $2^{19}$ | 78,100 | 241 | 153 | 37 | 532 |
| $2^{20}$ | 297,000 | 551 | 370 | 97 | 1,480 |
| $2^{21}$ | $1,130,000$ | 1,240 | 891 | 244 | 4,170 |
| $2^{22}$ | $4,280,000$ | 2,980 | 2,190 | 617 | 12,200 |
| $2^{23}$ | $16,800,000$ | 6,330 | 5,110 | 1,500 | 36,800 |
| $2^{24}$ | $66,800,000$ | 14,200 | 11,750 | 3,520 | 113,000 |
| $2^{25}$ | $244,000,000$ | 31,900 | 28,200 | 8,220 | 395,000 |
| $2^{26}$ | $972,000,000$ | 83,300 | 62,700 | 19,700 | $1,060,000$ |

(Intel Xeon E7-8867v3 3.3 GHz CPU seconds).


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Subject to our assumption that $L_{\mathrm{an}} \in \mathcal{S}^{\text {poly }}$. But if the algorithm fails we have an explicit counterexample to the conjectured Langlands correspondence.

