Powered by Volcanoes: Three New Algorithms

#### Andrew V. Sutherland

Massachusetts Institute of Technology

May 12, 2009

http://math.mit.edu/~drew/

arXiv.org/abs/0902.4670 arXiv.org/abs/0903.2785



### A 3-volcano of height 2



#### $\ell$ -volcanoes

An  $\ell$ -volcano is a connected undirected graph whose vertices are partitioned into levels  $V_0, \ldots, V_h$ .

1. The subgraph on  $V_0$  (the *surface*) is a connected *d*-regular graph, for some  $d \le 2$ .

#### *ℓ*-volcanoes

An  $\ell$ -volcano is a connected undirected graph whose vertices are partitioned into levels  $V_0, \ldots, V_h$ .

- 1. The subgraph on  $V_0$  (the *surface*) is a connected *d*-regular graph, for some  $d \le 2$ .
- 2. For k > 0, each  $v \in V_k$  has exactly one neighbor in  $V_{k-1}$ . All edges not on the surface arise in this manner.
- 3. For k < h, each  $v \in V_k$  has degree  $\ell$ +1.

#### *ℓ*-volcanoes

An  $\ell$ -volcano is a connected undirected graph whose vertices are partitioned into levels  $V_0, \ldots, V_h$ .

- 1. The subgraph on  $V_0$  (the *surface*) is a connected *d*-regular graph, for some  $d \le 2$ .
- 2. For k > 0, each  $v \in V_k$  has exactly one neighbor in  $V_{k-1}$ . All edges not on the surface arise in this manner.
- 3. For k < h, each  $v \in V_k$  has degree  $\ell$ +1.

The integers  $\ell$ , h, and  $|V_0|$  uniquely determine the shape.

### $\ell$ -isogenies

An *isogeny*  $\phi : E_1 \to E_2$  is a morphism that fixes the identity. It induces a group homomorphism  $\phi : E_1(\bar{F}) \to E_2(\bar{F})$ .

### *ℓ*-isogenies

An *isogeny*  $\phi : E_1 \to E_2$  is a morphism that fixes the identity. It induces a group homomorphism  $\phi : E_1(\bar{F}) \to E_2(\bar{F})$ .

The degree of a (separable) isogeny is  $|\ker \phi|$ . We are interested in isogenies of prime degree  $\ell$ . Such an isogeny is necessarily cyclic.

The dual isogeny  $\hat{\phi}: E_2 \rightarrow E_1$  has the same degree.

### The classical modular polynomial $\Phi_{\ell}$

The polynomial  $\Phi_{\ell} \in \mathbb{Z}[X, Y]$  has the property

$$\Phi_{\ell}(j(E_1), j(E_2)) = 0 \iff E_1 \text{ and } E_2 \text{ are } \ell \text{-isogenous.}$$

Note that  $\Phi_{\ell}$  is symmetric in *X* and *Y*.

### The classical modular polynomial $\Phi_{\ell}$

The polynomial  $\Phi_{\ell} \in \mathbb{Z}[X, Y]$  has the property

 $\Phi_{\ell}(j(E_1), j(E_2)) = 0 \iff E_1 \text{ and } E_2 \text{ are } \ell \text{-isogenous.}$ 

Note that  $\Phi_{\ell}$  is symmetric in *X* and *Y*.

The  $\ell$ -isogeny graph  $G_{\ell}/\mathbb{F}_q$  has vertex set  $\{j(E) : E/\mathbb{F}_q\}$  and edges  $(j_1, j_2)$  whenever  $\Phi_{\ell}(j_1, j_2) = 0$  (in  $\mathbb{F}_q$ ).

The neighbors of *j* in  $G_{\ell}$  are the roots of  $\Phi_{\ell}(X, j) \in \mathbb{F}_q[X]$ .

#### The classical modular polynomial $\Phi_{\ell}$

The polynomial  $\Phi_{\ell} \in \mathbb{Z}[X, Y]$  has the property

 $\Phi_{\ell}(j(E_1), j(E_2)) = 0 \iff E_1 \text{ and } E_2 \text{ are } \ell \text{-isogenous.}$ 

Note that  $\Phi_{\ell}$  is symmetric in *X* and *Y*.

The  $\ell$ -isogeny graph  $G_{\ell}/\mathbb{F}_q$  has vertex set  $\{j(E) : E/\mathbb{F}_q\}$  and edges  $(j_1, j_2)$  whenever  $\Phi_{\ell}(j_1, j_2) = 0$  (in  $\mathbb{F}_q$ ).

The neighbors of *j* in  $G_{\ell}$  are the roots of  $\Phi_{\ell}(X, j) \in \mathbb{F}_q[X]$ .

 $\Phi_{\ell}$  is big:  $O(\ell^3 \log \ell)$  bits.

# The shape of $G_{\ell}$

An elliptic curve is *ordinary* (not *supersingular*) iff its trace is nonzero in  $\mathbb{F}_q$ . Two curves whose *j*-invariants lie in the same component of  $G_\ell$  are either both ordinary or both supersingular.

#### Theorem

The ordinary connected components of  $G_{\ell}$  are  $\ell$ -volcanoes. (assuming  $j \neq 0, 1728$ )

Isogenous curves may lie in distint components of  $G_{\ell}$ . The components of  $G_{\ell}$  are a refinement of isogeny classes.











### Finding a shortest path to the floor



### Finding a shortest path to the floor



### Finding a shortest path to the floor



# The endomorphism ring End(E)

An endomorphism is an isogeny  $\phi : E \to E$ . The multiplication by *m* map  $P \rightsquigarrow mP$  is an example.

The set End(E) of all endomorphisms of *E* forms a ring which contains a subring isomorphic to  $\mathbb{Z}$ .

Over  $\mathbb{F}_q$  we have  $\mathbb{Z} \subsetneq \operatorname{End}(E)$ , since

 $\pi:(X,Y)\rightsquigarrow(X^q,Y^q)$ 

is not a multiplication by *m* map.

# End(E) for an ordinary elliptic curve

If *E* is ordinary than  $End(E) \cong O$ , where *O* is an order in an imaginary quadratic field *K*.

We may regard  $\pi$  as an element of O with trace *t* and norm *q*. The norm equation for  $\pi$  has the form

$$4q=t^2-v^2D_K,$$

where  $K = \mathbb{Q}[\sqrt{D_K}]$  and *v* is the conductor of  $\mathbb{Z}[\pi]$ .

We have  $\mathbb{Z}[\pi] \subseteq \mathcal{O} \subseteq \mathcal{O}_K$ , and therefore  $\mathcal{O}$  has discriminant  $D = u^2 D_K$  for some conductor u | v.

### The vertical structure of an $\ell$ -volcano

#### Theorem (Kohel)

Let  $V_0, \ldots, V_h$  be the levels of an  $\ell$ -volcano corresponding to an ordinary component of  $G_{\ell}/\mathbb{F}_q$ .

- 1. The curves in V<sub>i</sub> all have the same endomorphism ring type, with discriminant D<sub>i</sub>.
- 2.  $D_0$  has conductor prime to  $\ell$ , and  $D_i = \ell^{2i} D_0$ .

### The vertical structure of an $\ell$ -volcano

#### Theorem (Kohel)

Let  $V_0, \ldots, V_h$  be the levels of an  $\ell$ -volcano corresponding to an ordinary component of  $G_{\ell}/\mathbb{F}_q$ .

- 1. The curves in V<sub>i</sub> all have the same endomorphism ring type, with discriminant D<sub>i</sub>.
- 2.  $D_0$  has conductor prime to  $\ell$ , and  $D_i = \ell^{2i} D_0$ .

This implies  $\ell^h \parallel v$ , allowing us to determine the height.

The endomorphism ring type of an ordinary elliptic curve *E* is determined by its level on its  $\ell$ -volcano for each prime  $\ell | v$ .

## The class group action [CM theory]

Suppose  $\text{End}(E) \cong \mathcal{O}$ , and let  $\mathfrak{a}$  an invertible  $\mathcal{O}$ -ideal. Let  $E[\mathfrak{a}]$  be the points annihilated by all  $a \in \mathfrak{a} \subset \mathcal{O} \cong \text{End}(E)$ .

There is a separable isogeny  $\phi_{\mathfrak{a}} : E \to E/E[\mathfrak{a}]$  with kernel  $E[\mathfrak{a}]$ , degree  $N(\mathfrak{a})$ , and  $End(\phi_{\mathfrak{a}}(E)) \cong \mathcal{O}$ .

## The class group action [CM theory]

Suppose  $\text{End}(E) \cong \mathcal{O}$ , and let  $\mathfrak{a}$  an invertible  $\mathcal{O}$ -ideal. Let  $E[\mathfrak{a}]$  be the points annihilated by all  $a \in \mathfrak{a} \subset \mathcal{O} \cong \text{End}(E)$ .

There is a separable isogeny  $\phi_{\mathfrak{a}} : E \to E/E[\mathfrak{a}]$  with kernel  $E[\mathfrak{a}]$ , degree  $N(\mathfrak{a})$ , and  $End(\phi_{\mathfrak{a}}(E)) \cong \mathcal{O}$ .

This defines a group action by the ideal group of  $\mathcal{O}$  on the set

$$\mathcal{E}(\mathcal{O}) = \{ j(E) : \operatorname{End}(E) \cong \mathcal{O} \},\$$

which factors through the class group cl(O).

## The class group action [CM theory]

Suppose  $\text{End}(E) \cong \mathcal{O}$ , and let  $\mathfrak{a}$  an invertible  $\mathcal{O}$ -ideal. Let  $E[\mathfrak{a}]$  be the points annihilated by all  $a \in \mathfrak{a} \subset \mathcal{O} \cong \text{End}(E)$ .

There is a separable isogeny  $\phi_{\mathfrak{a}} : E \to E/E[\mathfrak{a}]$  with kernel  $E[\mathfrak{a}]$ , degree  $N(\mathfrak{a})$ , and  $End(\phi_{\mathfrak{a}}(E)) \cong \mathcal{O}$ .

This defines a group action by the ideal group of  $\mathcal{O}$  on the set

$$\mathcal{E}(\mathcal{O}) = \{ j(E) : \operatorname{End}(E) \cong \mathcal{O} \},\$$

which factors through the class group  $cl(\mathcal{O})$ .

The above applies over  $\mathbb{C}$ , but if  $E/\mathbb{F}_q$  has  $\operatorname{End}(E) \cong \mathcal{O}$ , then q is the norm of an element of  $\mathcal{O}$  and we may reduce to  $\mathbb{F}_q$ .

### The horizontal structure of an ordinary *l*-volcano

The degree *d* of the subgraph on  $V_0$  is  $1 + \left(\frac{D_K}{\ell}\right)$ .

For d = 0 we have  $|V_0| = 1$  and for d = 1 we have  $|V_0| = 2$ .

When d = 2 there are two O-ideals of norm  $\ell$ ,  $\mathfrak{a}$  and  $\overline{\mathfrak{a}}$ , and their ideal classes have order  $|V_0|$ .

### The horizontal structure of an ordinary *l*-volcano

The degree *d* of the subgraph on  $V_0$  is  $1 + \left(\frac{D_K}{\ell}\right)$ .

For d = 0 we have  $|V_0| = 1$  and for d = 1 we have  $|V_0| = 2$ .

When d = 2 there are two O-ideals of norm  $\ell$ ,  $\mathfrak{a}$  and  $\overline{\mathfrak{a}}$ , and their ideal classes have order  $|V_0|$ .

The set  $\mathcal{E}(\mathcal{O})$  has size  $h(\mathcal{O})$  and is comprised of the surfaces of isomorphic  $\ell$ -volcanoes corresponding to cosets in  $cl(\mathcal{O})$ .

And in general,  $\mathcal{E}(\mathcal{O})$  is a *torsor* for  $cl(\mathcal{O})$ .

### The CM method

If  $E/\mathbb{F}_q$  has N = q + 1 - t points, with  $t \neq 0$  in  $\mathbb{F}_q$ , then

$$4q=t^2-v^2D,$$

where *D* is the discriminant of  $\mathcal{O} \cong \text{End}(E)$ . Conversely, any curve with  $\text{End}(E) \cong O$  has trace  $\pm t$ .

The Hilbert class polynomial  $H_D \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  is defined by

$$H_D(X) = \prod_{j \in \mathcal{E}(\mathcal{O})} (X - j).$$

Its roots are the *j*-invariants of curves with  $End(E) \cong O$ .

Given a root of  $H_D$  in  $\mathbb{F}_q$ , we may construct  $E/\mathbb{F}_q$  with N points.

# Computing $H_D(X)$ with the CRT [ALV '06, BBEL '08]

To compute  $H_D \in \mathbb{F}_q[X]$  it suffices to compute  $H_D$  modulo many "small" primes *p* and apply the Chinese Remainder Theorem.

For primes of the form  $4p = t_p^2 - v_p^2 D$ ,  $H_D$  splits completely over  $\mathbb{F}_p$  and we may compute  $H_D \mod p$  by finding its roots.

# Computing $H_D(X)$ with the CRT [ALV '06, BBEL '08]

To compute  $H_D \in \mathbb{F}_q[X]$  it suffices to compute  $H_D$  modulo many "small" primes *p* and apply the Chinese Remainder Theorem.

For primes of the form  $4p = t_{\rho}^2 - v_{\rho}^2 D$ ,  $H_D$  splits completely over  $\mathbb{F}_p$  and we may compute  $H_D \mod p$  by finding its roots.

To find the first root, generate random curves over  $\mathbb{F}_p$  until we find one with  $\text{End}(E) \cong \mathcal{O}$  (or any *E* with trace  $\pm t$ ).

To enumerate the other roots, use the group action of cl(O).

### Improvements [S '09]

The CRT approach to computing  $H_D$  can be improved:

- 1. Compute  $H_D \mod P$  in  $O(|D|^{1/2+\epsilon} \log P)$  space.
- 2. Generate "random" curves with prescribed torsion.
- 3. Make  $v_p$  large (bigger volcanoes are easier to find).
- 4. Use an optimal presentation of cl(O) to minimize norms.

### An example of a polycyclic presentation

For D = -79947, cl(D) is cyclic of order h(D) = 100. It is generated by the class of an ideal with norm 19.

But cl(*D*) is also generated by classes  $\alpha_2$  and  $\alpha_{13}$  of ideals of norm 2 and 13. The elements  $\alpha_2$  and  $\alpha_{13}$  have orders 20 and 50 and are not independent ( $\alpha_{13}^5 = \alpha_2^{18}$ ).

### An example of a polycyclic presentation

For D = -79947, cl(D) is cyclic of order h(D) = 100. It is generated by the class of an ideal with norm 19.

But cl(*D*) is also generated by classes  $\alpha_2$  and  $\alpha_{13}$  of ideals of norm 2 and 13. The elements  $\alpha_2$  and  $\alpha_{13}$  have orders 20 and 50 and are not independent ( $\alpha_{13}^5 = \alpha_2^{18}$ ).

Nevertheless, every  $\beta \in cl(D)$  can be written uniquely as

$$\beta = \alpha_2^{e_2} \alpha_{13}^{e_{13}}$$

with  $0 \le e_2 < 20$  and  $0 \le e_{13} < 5$ .

Using this presentation is about 100 times faster.















### **Record-breaking CM constructions**

Largest |D|Old Record (June 2008, complex analytic [Enge]) D = -70,901,505,867 h(D) = 51,244New Record (October 2008, CRT method [Enge-S]) D = -102,197,306,669,747 h(D) = 2,014,236

## **Record-breaking CM constructions**

Largest |D|Old Record (June 2008, complex analytic [Enge]) D = -70,901,505,867 h(D) = 51,244New Record (October 2008, CRT method [Enge-S]) D = -102,197,306,669,747 h(D) = 2,014,236Largest h(D)

Old Record (January 2006, complex analytic [Enge]) D = -2,093,236,031 h(D) = 100,000

New Record (April 2009, CRT method, [Bröker-S])

D = -4,058,817,012,071 h(D) = 5,000,000

### Performance comparison

|            |        | Analytic w <sub>3,13</sub> |         | CRT f <sup>2</sup> |       | CRT f  |       |
|------------|--------|----------------------------|---------|--------------------|-------|--------|-------|
| -D         | h(D)   | height                     | time    | height*            | time* | height | time  |
| 6961631    | 5000   | 9.5k                       | 28      | 9.5k               | 4.9   | 3.8k   | 2.0   |
| 23512271   | 10000  | 20k                        | 210     | 20k                | 24    | 8.0k   | 9.1   |
| 98016239   | 20000  | 45k                        | 1,800   | 45k                | 120   | 18k    | 46    |
| 357116231  | 40000  | 97k                        | 14,000  | 97k                | 574   | 38k    | 220   |
| 2093236031 | 100000 | 265k                       | 260,000 | 265k               | 4,400 | 103k   | 1,600 |

#### Complex Analytic vs. CRT method

(2.4 GHz AMD Opteron CPU seconds)

\*increased to match the height bound for  $w_{3,13}$ .

# Computing End(E) [Bisson-S '09]

Given  $E/\mathbb{F}_q$  we may compute *t* and factor  $4q - t^2$  to obtain

$$4q=t^2-v^2D_K.$$

The discriminant of  $\text{End}(E) \cong \mathcal{O}$  is  $D = u^2 D_K$  for some u | v To determine End(E) it suffices to compute u.

# Computing End(E) [Bisson-S '09]

Given  $E/\mathbb{F}_q$  we may compute *t* and factor  $4q - t^2$  to obtain

$$4q=t^2-v^2D_K.$$

The discriminant of  $\text{End}(E) \cong \mathcal{O}$  is  $D = u^2 D_K$  for some u | v To determine End(E) it suffices to compute u.

Let  $u_1, \ldots, u_n$  be the factors of v. To distinguish u, we seek *relations* that hold in some  $cl(u_i^2 D_K)$  but not others.

We test these relations in the isogeny graph by walking along the surface of various  $\ell$ -volcanoes.

### Relations in class groups

A relation *R* is a pair of vectors  $(\ell_1, \ldots, \ell_r)$  and  $(e_1, \ldots, e_r)$ , with  $\ell_i \nmid v$  and  $\left(\frac{D_K}{\ell_i}\right) = 1$ .

We say *R* holds in cl(*D*) if for each *i* there is an  $\alpha_i \in cl(D)$  containing an ideal of norm  $\ell_i$  such that  $\alpha_1^{e_1} \cdots \alpha_r^{e_r} = 1$ .

### Relations in class groups

A relation *R* is a pair of vectors  $(\ell_1, \ldots, \ell_r)$  and  $(e_1, \ldots, e_r)$ , with  $\ell_i \nmid v$  and  $\left(\frac{D_K}{\ell_i}\right) = 1$ .

We say *R* holds in cl(*D*) if for each *i* there is an  $\alpha_i \in cl(D)$  containing an ideal of norm  $\ell_i$  such that  $\alpha_1^{e_1} \cdots \alpha_r^{e_r} = 1$ .

More generally, define the *cardinality* of R in cl(D) by

$$\# \mathbf{R}/\operatorname{cl}(\mathbf{D}) = \# \left\{ \tau \in \{\pm 1\}^r : \prod \alpha_i^{\tau_i e_i} = 1 \text{ in } \operatorname{cl}(\mathbf{D}) \right\}.$$

For p|v, let  $D_1 = (v/p)^2 D_K$  and  $D_2 = p^2 D_K$ . We want

$$\#R/\operatorname{cl}(D_1) > \#R/\operatorname{cl}(D_2).$$

Counting relations in the isogeny graph

To compute  $\#R/cl(\mathcal{O})$ :

- 1. Let  $J_0$  be a list consisting of j(E).
- 2. For *i* from 1 to *r*:
  - For each *j* ∈ *J*<sub>*i*−1</sub>, walk *e<sub>i</sub>* steps in both directions on the surface of the *ℓ<sub>i</sub>*-volcano and append the endpoints to *J<sub>i</sub>*.
- 3. Output the number of times j(E) occurs in  $J_r$ .

Counting relations in the isogeny graph

To compute  $\#R/cl(\mathcal{O})$ :

- 1. Let  $J_0$  be a list consisting of j(E).
- 2. For *i* from 1 to *r*:
  - For each *j* ∈ *J*<sub>*i*−1</sub>, walk *e<sub>i</sub>* steps in both directions on the surface of the *ℓ<sub>i</sub>*-volcano and append the endpoints to *J<sub>i</sub>*.
- 3. Output the number of times j(E) occurs in  $J_r$ .

To compute  $\#R/cl(\mathcal{O})$  efficiently, we use *smooth* relations, where  $\ell_i$ ,  $e_i$ , and r are all small.

## Record-breaking End(E) computations

Heuristically, we achieve a running time of  $L[1/2, \sqrt{3}/2]$ .

Over a 200-bit prime field, under 15 minutes. Over a 256-bit prime field, about 4 hours.

These are worst-case examples (average case is easy).

## Record-breaking End(E) computations

Heuristically, we achieve a running time of  $L[1/2, \sqrt{3}/2]$ .

Over a 200-bit prime field, under 15 minutes. Over a 256-bit prime field, about 4 hours.

These are worst-case examples (average case is easy).

Kohel's algorithm has complexity  $O(q^{1/3})$  (under the GRH). It cannot feasibly compute End(E) over a cryptographic size field when v contains a large prime factor. Computing  $\Phi_{\ell}$  with the CRT method [Bröker-Lauter-S]

Choose CRT primes  $p \equiv 1 \mod \ell$  with  $4p = t^2 - v^2 \ell^2 D$ . Suppose we have an  $\ell$ -volcano of height 1 with  $|V_0| \ge \ell + 2$ . (we may pick *D* to ensure this). Computing  $\Phi_{\ell}$  with the CRT method [Bröker-Lauter-S]

Choose CRT primes  $p \equiv 1 \mod \ell$  with  $4p = t^2 - v^2 \ell^2 D$ . Suppose we have an  $\ell$ -volcano of height 1 with  $|V_0| \ge \ell + 2$ . (we may pick *D* to ensure this).

We can "construct" this volcano without using  $\Phi_{\ell}$ :

- 1. Use  $H_D(X)$  to find the surface.
- 2. Apply the action of cl(D) to enumerate the surface.
- 3. Use Velu's formula to descend to the floor.
- 4. Apply the action of  $cl(\ell^2 D)$  to enumerate the floor.

From this we can interpolate  $\Phi_{\ell} \mod p$ .

### Record-breaking $\Phi_\ell$ computations

The time to compute  $\Phi_{\ell}$  is  $O(\ell^3 \log^{3+\epsilon} \ell)$  [GRH]. Faster than the best alternative by a factor of  $\log \ell$ .

#### Record $\Phi_{\ell}$ computations (classical)

Computed  $\Phi_{\ell}$  for all  $\ell < 3000$ , and up to  $\ell = 5003$ . Output is generated at a rate of about 5Mb/s.

Previous record:  $\ell$  < 360 [Rubinstein-Seroussi].

### Record-breaking $\Phi_{\ell}$ computations

The time to compute  $\Phi_{\ell}$  is  $O(\ell^3 \log^{3+\epsilon} \ell)$  [GRH]. Faster than the best alternative by a factor of  $\log \ell$ .

#### Record $\Phi_{\ell}$ computations (classical)

Computed  $\Phi_{\ell}$  for all  $\ell < 3000$ , and up to  $\ell = 5003$ . Output is generated at a rate of about 5Mb/s.

Previous record:  $\ell$  < 360 [Rubinstein-Seroussi].

Record modular polynomial computations (Weber  $\mathfrak{f}$ ) Computed  $\Phi_{\ell}$  for all  $\ell < 10000$  and up to  $\ell = 50021$ .

Preprint in preparation.

### Modular polynomials for $\ell = 7$

Classical:

$$\begin{split} X^8 + Y^8 - X^7 Y^7 + 5208 X^7 Y^6 - 10246068 X^7 Y^5 + 9437674400 X^7 Y^4 - 4079701128594 X^7 Y^3 + \\ 720168419610864 X^7 Y^2 - 34993297342013192 X^7 Y + 104545516658688000 X^7 + \\ \dots (2 \text{ pages omitted}) \dots + \\ 13483958224762213714698012883865296529472356352000000000000 Y^3 + \end{split}$$

Atkin:

$$\begin{split} & X^8 - X^7 \, Y + 744 X^7 + 196476 X^6 + 357 X^5 Y + 21226520 X^5 + 1428 X^4 \, Y + \\ & 803037606 X^4 - 31647 X^3 \, Y + 14547824088 X^3 - 204792 X^2 \, Y + 138917735740 X^2 + \\ & 186955 XY + 677600447400 X + Y^2 + 2128500 \, Y + 1335206318625 \end{split}$$

Canonical:

$$X^{8} + 28X^{7} + 322X^{6} + 1904X^{5} + 5915X^{4} + 8624X^{3} + 4018X^{2} - XY + 748X + 49$$

Weber:

$$X^{8} + Y^{8} - X^{7}Y^{7} + 7X^{4}Y^{4} - 8XY$$

Powered by Volcanoes: Three New Algorithms

#### Andrew V. Sutherland

Massachusetts Institute of Technology

May 12, 2009

http://math.mit.edu/~drew/

arXiv.org/abs/0902.4670 arXiv.org/abs/0903.2785